

The New York Times

# The Opinion Pages

Search All NYTimes.com  Go

SOMETHING'S ALWAYS  
**ON SALE AT**  
Light the box

Advertise on NYTimes.com

OP-ED COLUMNIST

## The Unwisdom of Elites

By PAUL KRUGMAN  
Published: May 8, 2011

The past three years have been a disaster for most Western economies. The United States has mass long-term unemployment for the first time since the 1930s. Meanwhile, Europe's single currency is coming apart at the seams. How did it all go so wrong?



Fred R. Conrad/The New York Times  
Paul Krugman

Go to Columnist Page »

Blog: [The Conscience of a Liberal](#)

### Readers' Comments

Readers shared their thoughts on this article.  
[Read All Comments \(540\) »](#)

Well, what I've been hearing with growing frequency from members of the policy elite — self-appointed wise men, officials, and pundits in good standing — is the claim that it's mostly the public's fault. The idea is that we got into this mess because voters wanted something for nothing, and weak-minded politicians catered to the electorate's foolishness.

So this seems like a good time to point out that this blame-the-public view isn't just self-serving, it's dead wrong.

The fact is that what we're experiencing right now is a top-down disaster. The policies that got us into this mess weren't responses to public demand. They were, with few exceptions, policies championed by small groups of influential people — in many cases, the same people now lecturing the rest of us on the need to get serious. And by trying to shift the blame to the general populace, elites are ducking some much-needed reflection on their own

catastrophic mistakes.

Let me focus mainly on what happened in the United States, then say a few words about Europe.

These days Americans get constant lectures about the need to reduce the budget deficit. That focus in itself represents distorted priorities, since our immediate concern should be job creation. But suppose we restrict ourselves to talking about the deficit, and ask: What happened to the budget surplus the federal government had in 2000?

The answer is, three main things. First, there were the Bush tax cuts, which added roughly \$2 trillion to the national debt over the last decade. Second, there were the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan, which added an additional \$1.1 trillion or so. And third was the Great Recession, which led both to a collapse in revenue and to a sharp rise in spending on unemployment insurance and other safety-net programs.

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

COMMENTS (540)

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

REPRINTS

SHARE



Log in to see what your friends are sharing on nytimes.com.  
[Privacy Policy](#) | [What's This?](#)

Log In With Facebook

### What's Popular Now

TeenNick's '90s Nostalgia Fest



The Road Not Taken



Ads by Google

what's this?

**Settle Federal Tax Debt**  
Get Rid of Your IRS Tax Debt Today! Guaranteed, Trusted, Quick Results.  
[CTRTaxRelief.com/settle](#)

**Prototyping Quotes**  
Get Instant Quotes On High Quality Rapid Prototypes. Contact Us Today!  
[www.DPT-Fast.com](#)

**Who Said About Goldline?**  
"This is a top notch organization that's been in business since 1960"  
[www.Goldline.com/Guess-Who](#)

**Travel Insurance Quotes**  
Compare And Buy Travel Insurance For Your Trip. Buy Online or Call.  
[www.InsureMyTrip.com](#)

**The Great Recovery**  
Economic recovery starts with you. Join Dave Ramsey & lead the way.  
[www.thegreatrecovery.com](#)

**Euro Debt Crisis**  
The European Debt Crisis will shake the world... Free Report  
[MoneyMorning.com/Euro\\_Death](#)

### Today's Headlines Daily E-Mail



MOST E-MAILED

RECOMMENDED FOR YOU



1. [City in Rhode Island Asks Retirees to Sacrifice](#)

2. [Lawyer Is Convicted of Larceny in a \\$100 Million Stock Swindle](#)

3. [NATIONAL BRIEFING | MIDWEST Illinois Governor Is Told to Pay Raises](#)

Log in to discover more articles based on what you've read.

OPEN

So who was responsible for these budget busters? It wasn't the man in the street.

President George W. Bush cut taxes in the service of his party's ideology, not in response to a groundswell of popular demand — and the bulk of the cuts went to a small, affluent minority.

Similarly, Mr. Bush chose to invade Iraq because that was something he and his advisers wanted to do, not because Americans were clamoring for war against a regime that had nothing to do with 9/11. In fact, it took a highly deceptive sales campaign to get Americans to support the invasion, and even so, voters were never as solidly behind the war as America's political and pundit elite.

Finally, the Great Recession was brought on by a runaway financial sector, empowered by reckless deregulation. And who was responsible for that deregulation? Powerful people in Washington with close ties to the financial industry, that's who. Let me give a particular shout-out to Alan Greenspan, who played a crucial role both in financial deregulation and in the passage of the Bush tax cuts — and who is now, of course, among those hectoring us about the deficit.

So it was the bad judgment of the elite, not the greediness of the common man, that caused America's deficit. And much the same is true of the European crisis.

Needless to say, that's not what you hear from European policy makers. The official story in Europe these days is that governments of troubled nations catered too much to the masses, promising too much to voters while collecting too little in taxes. And that is, to be fair, a reasonably accurate story for Greece. But it's not at all what happened in Ireland and Spain, both of which had low debt and budget surpluses on the eve of the crisis.

The real story of Europe's crisis is that leaders created a single currency, the euro, without creating the institutions that were needed to cope with booms and busts within the euro zone. And the drive for a single European currency was the ultimate top-down project, an elite vision imposed on highly reluctant voters.

Does any of this matter? Why should we be concerned about the effort to shift the blame for bad policies onto the general public?

One answer is simple accountability. People who advocated budget-busting policies during the Bush years shouldn't be allowed to pass themselves off as deficit hawks; people who [praised Ireland](#) as a role model shouldn't be giving lectures on responsible government.

But the larger answer, I'd argue, is that by making up stories about our current predicament that absolve the people who put us here there, we cut off any chance to learn from the crisis. We need to place the blame where it belongs, to chasten our policy elites. Otherwise, they'll do even more damage in the years ahead.

A version of this op-ed appeared in print on May 9, 2011, on page A23 of the New York edition with the headline: The Unwisdom of Elites.

[Get unlimited access for just 99¢ for your first 4 weeks.](#)

COMMENTS (540)

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

REPRINTS

**More Headlines From Around the Web**

Sponsored Links

CNBC  
10 Companies That Make Billions From The U.S. Government

BANK RATE

**Get Free E-mail Alerts on These Topics**

United States Economy

Regulation and Deregulation of Industry

Bush, George W

ADVERTISEMENTS



Explore un petit maison - NYTimes.com/Style

**BECOME A DIGITAL SUBSCRIBER.**  
JUST 99¢ FOR 4 WEEKS. GET UNLIMITED ACCESS ▶  
The New York Times nytimes.com

Ads by Google

what's this?

**The End-Time is Here**

2008 was God's last warning,  
2011 is global economic collapse  
[www.the-end.com](http://www.the-end.com)

OPEN

Social Security: Take early bird special?

Federal Taxes (US)

CON WORLD

Ron Paul seeks audit of Treasury gold

CNBC

20 Cities You Don't Want to Live In ... Yet

Ads by Google

what's this?

### [Alzheimer's vs Dementia](#)

Learn to recognize if your symptoms are normal aging or Alzheimer's.

[www.JohnsHopkinsHealthAlerts.com](http://www.JohnsHopkinsHealthAlerts.com)

#### INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



DINING & WINE »



Review: New York's New Frozen Treats

HEALTH »



Athletic Performance and the Monthly Cycle

OPINION »

**Editorial: Blame Congress**  
Congress has failed to enact climate change legislation that would have encouraged innovation.

U.S. »



Utah Liquor Laws, as Mixed Up as Some Drinks

THEATER »



London's Pub Theaters Still Thrive

OPINION »



Op-Ed: Sizzle Factor for a Restless Climate

[Home](#) | [World](#) | [U.S.](#) | [N.Y./Region](#) | [Business](#) | [Technology](#) | [Science](#) | [Health](#) | [Sports](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Arts](#) | [Style](#) | [Travel](#) | [Jobs](#) | [Real Estate](#) | [Autos](#) | [Site Map](#)  
© 2011 The New York Times Company. | [Privacy](#) | [Your Ad Choices](#) | [Terms of Service](#) | [Terms of Sale](#) | [Corrections](#) | [RSS](#) | [Help](#) | [Contact Us](#) | [Work for Us](#) | [Advertise](#)

